

# STUDENTS' COUNCIL

---

Thursday February 16, 2006  
Council Chambers 2-1 University Hall

## ORDER PAPER (SC 2005-22)

- 2005-22/1      CALL TO ORDER
- 2005-22/2      SPEAKER'S BUSINESS
- 2005-22/2a     Announcements – The next meeting of Students' Council will take place on Tuesday February 28, 2006.
- 2005-22/3      APPROVAL OF THE ORDERS OF THE DAY
- 2005-22/4      PRESENTATIONS
- 2005-22/4a     Bill Smith and Jason Tobias on the Travel Cuts Law Suit.
- 2005-22/5      NOMINATIONS
- 2005-22/6      REPORTS AND EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE REPORT
- 2005-22/6a     Executive Committee
- 2005-22/6a (i) **LETTNER/TOBIAS MOVED THAT** Students' Council grant the Executive Committee authority to approve a joint settlement agreement to resolve the TravelCUTS lawsuit entered into by Students' Council August 1, 2000.
- 2005-22/7      QUESTION PERIOD
- 2005-22/8      BOARD AND COMMITTEE REPORTS
- 2005-22/8a     Audit Committee - February 8, 2006
- Please see document SC 05-22.01
- 2005-22/9      GENERAL ORDERS
- 2005-22/9a     **POWER MOVED THAT** Bill #28 be read a first time.
- Bill #28 *Effective Political Policy Reform* (sponsor; POWER)**  
                    Principles (first reading)

1. The existing legislative provisions regarding political policy are repealed.
2. Political policies are directives from students' council to the exec committee outlining where students' unions advocacy efforts should be directed.
3. For each political policy passed the exec committee is required to develop an implementation plan, which will outline the actions to be taken and resources required in a given year.
4. Are adopted, amended or rescinded by two simple majority votes of students' council occurring not less than 7 days apart.

2005-22/9b

**KELLY ORDERED THAT** Students' Council censure the President.

2005-22/10

**INFORMATION ITEMS**

2005-22/10a

Votes and Proceedings – January 31 and February 7, 2006

Please see document SC 05-22.02

2005-22/10b

UHS Response to M. Mustafa Hirji's comments on the UHS Fee increase.

Hard copies available at meeting and in 2-900.

2005-22/10c

M. Mustafa Hirji response to UHS response to comments

Please see document SC 05-22.03

# MINUTES

2005-06

## Audit Committee

Wednesday, February 8, 2006

ATTENDANCE: Theresa Chapman Cam Lewis  
Prem Eruvs Tim Schneider (guest)  
Bryce Kustra Eugene Lee from APIRG (guest)

CALL TO ORDER: 2:04 pm

NEW BUSINESS:

- Eruvs/Chapman motion to approve the disbursement of the APIRG DFU. (0-2-2(Eruvs, Lewis))  
We were joined once again by Eugene from APIRG to discuss the disbursement of the APIRG DFU. What we hoped would be a short meeting once again turned into an episode in frustration. During our previous meeting with Eugene we had outlined three concerns that would need to be resolved before the DFU was dispersed: an official copy of the Audit, a plan of action to reduce the contingency fund and a plan of action for investing the contingency fund. While the APIRG Board of Directors had discussed these, Audit Committee did not feel that 'discussion' was a strong enough commitment. We thus requested written commitment from the APIRG Board of Directors that the contingency fund would be reduced and that the funds would be invested. Furthermore, we did not yet have a copy of the signed, official APIRG audit from the auditors. Audit Committee also brought its concerns about APIRG's accounting to Eugene's concern. APIRG does not currently implement Generally Accepted Account Principles and there are examples of shifting in the year-end statements to equate revenues and expenses. Audit Committee did not feel that the resources necessary to correct this were an effective use of students' money but we reinforced that in future years the disbursement process would be much simpler if this issue was resolved.

Audit Committee will reconvene and its earliest possible convenience (including reading week) once Eugene has been able to obtain all necessary documents.

NEXT MEETING: TBA

ADJOURNMENT: 3:46 pm

# STUDENTS' COUNCIL VOTES & PROCEEDINGS

---

Tuesday January 31, 2006  
Council Chambers 2-1 University Hall

## VOTES & PROCEEDINGS (SC 2005-20)

2005-20/1

### CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order at 6:03 p.m.

2005-20/2

### SPEAKER'S BUSINESS

2005-20/2a

Announcements – The next meeting of Student' Council will take place on February 7, 2006.

2005-20/3

### APPROVAL OF THE ORDERS OF THE DAY

**COOK/HUSSEIN MOVED TO** approve the orders of the day.

**POWER/TOBIAS MOVED TO** amend the order paper by striking items 4a and 4b.

Speaker's List (am): Power

**Amendment to the Order Paper: CARRIED**

**KIRKHAM/JOHNSON MOVED TO** amend the order paper by striking item 9d.

Speaker's List (am): Kirkham

**Amendment to the Order Paper: CARRIED**

**LETTNER/TOBIAS MOVED TO** amend the order paper by making item 7h a Special Order.

Speaker's List (am): Lettner, Kirkham, Lettner

**Amendment to the Order Paper: CARRIED, 12/4**

**SHAMANNA/JOHNSON MOVED TO** amend the order paper by making item 9f Special Order.

Speaker's List (am): Shamanna, Kirkham

**Amendment to the Order Paper: DEFEATED**

**POWER/LETTNER MOVED TO** amend the order paper by making item 7i (External Policy Committee) a Special Order.

**Amendment to the Order Paper: CARRIED**

**Main Motion: CARRIED**

*Special Order 7h (Budget and Finance Committee)*

**2005-20/7h (i) CELEN/PATZ MOVED THAT** Students' Council read Bill #26 a first time.

**Bill #26 – Changes to Gateway Student Journalism Fund Fees (sponsor; CELEN)**

Principles (first reading)

1. The amount for part-time students is amended to \$2.73 per student per Fall or Winter term.
2. The amount for students in the Spring and Summer terms is amended to \$0.36 per student per Spring or Summer term

Speaker's List (mm): Tobias, Shamanna, Cook (sponsors Dan Kaszor), Steve Smith, Johnson, Cook, Khanna, Steve Smith

**Main Motion: CARRIED**

**2005-20/7h (ii) TOBIAS/LETTNER MOVED THAT** Bill #24 be read a first time.

**Bill #24 - Budget Process (sponsor; LEWIS)**

Principles (first reading)

Operating Budget

1. The Project Allocation shall be not be more than \$50,000 per year
2. Expenditures from the Project Allocation below \$5,000 must be approved by the Executive Committee.

Allocating Spending Authority

1. Changes to the Operating budget above \$10,000 must be approved by Students' Council
2. Changes to the Operating Budget between \$5,000 and \$10,000 must be approved by the Budget and Finance Committee
3. Changes to the Operating Budget between \$1000-\$5000 must be approved by the Executive Committee
4. Changes to the operating budget below \$1000 must be approved by the Vice-President Operations and Finance, as well as the Executive Committee Member or Senior Manager responsible for the department requesting the change.
5. Changes to the operating budget that do not impact the net profit or loss of an operating unit must be approved by the Vice-President Operations and Finance.

Signing Authority

1. Consignment Cheques issued by SUBTitles do not require the signature of an elected officer.

Budget Process

1. The Budget Process currently described in bylaw shall be replaced by this bill.
2. The fiscal year of the Students' Union shall begin May 1 and end April 30.
3. Budget Principles describe in words the priorities to be enshrined in the final budget.
4. The Budget process shall be described in the Standing Order of Students' Council and shall be the purview of the Budget and Finance Committee
5. A final operating and capital budget must be approved by Council prior to the beginning of each fiscal year.
6. In the event that any parties are unable to meet the obligations outlined in the budget process, Students' Council shall retain the authority to appoint an appropriate proxy.
7. In the event that a final operating and capital budget is not passed before the beginning of the fiscal year, the previous year's budget may be used as an interim substitute.

**KIRKHAM/PAYNE MOVED TO** limit debate to 35 minutes.

**Motion to Limit Debate: CARRIED**

**TOBIAS/PAYNE MOVED TO** amend the main motion by adding new point 1 and striking points 2 through 5 under section "Allocating Spending Authority".

Speaker's List (am): Tobias, Berghoff, Tobias, Cook

**Amendment to the Main Motion: DEFEATED**

**TOBIAS/LETTNER MOVED TO** amend the main motion by adding the words "Budget and Finance Committee" to point 4 and striking point 6 and replacing it with "A preliminary budget document must be approved by Council at a meeting of prior to the approval of a final operating and capital budget" under the Budget Process section.

Speaker's List (am): Tobias

**BERGHOFF/SCHNEIDER MOVED TO** amend the amendment by striking the words "Budget and Finance Committee" and replace with "Students' Council".

Speaker's List (am to am): Berghoff

**Amendment to the amendment: CARRIED**

**Amendment to the Main Motion: CARRIED**

**TOBIAS/BERGHOFF MOVED TO** amend the main motion by striking the section called "Allocating Spending Authority".

**Amendment to the Main Motion: CARRIED**

**BERGHOFF/SCHNEIDER MOVED TO** amend the main motion by striking point 1 under "Operating Budget".

Speaker's List (am): Berghoff, Tobias

**Amendment to the Main Motion: DEFEATED****Main Motion: CARRIED*****Special Order 7i (External Policy Committee)***

**2005-20/7i (i)** **KAWANAMI/CROSSMAN MOVED THAT** Students' Council, upon the recommendation of the External Policy Committee, rescind the current political policy, "Tuition Levels and Regulation", and replace it with the new political policy, "Tuition Levels and Regulation."

Speaker's List (mm): Kawanami

**Main Motion: CARRIED, unanimous consent****2005-20/5** **NOMINATIONS**

**2005-20/5a** **KIRKHAM MOVED THAT** Students' Council appoint one (1) councillor to serve on the Awards Committee Selection Committee.

JOHNSON nominates KAWANAMI: Kawanami declines  
 COUNCILLOR nominates CHAPMAN: Chapman accepts  
 JOHNSON nominates YUSUF: Yusuf declines

**Councillor Chapman acclaimed to the Awards Committee Selection Committee**

**2005-20/5b** **KIRKHAM MOVED THAT** Students' Council appoint two (2) councillors to serve on the Chief Returning Officer Selection Committee.

KIRKHAM nominates KAWANAMI: Kawanami accepts  
 CHAPMAN nominates PAYNE: Payne accepts

**Councillors Kawanami and Payne acclaimed to the CRO Selection Committee****2005-20/6** **REPORTS****2005-20/6a** Mathieu Johnson, Vice President (Academic)**2005-20/6b** Graham Lettner, President**2005-20/6c** Samantha Power, Vice President (External)**2005-20/6d** Jason Tobias, Vice President (Operations and Finance)**2005-20/7** **BOARD AND COMMITTEE REPORTS****2005-20/7a** Executive Committee**2005-20/8** **QUESTION PERIOD****2005-20/7** **BOARD AND COMMITTEE REPORTS (Part 2)****2005-20/7b** Discipline, Interpretation and Enforcement Board – Ruling 10**2005-20/7c** Audit Committee

- 2005-20/7d Access Fund Committee
- 2005-20/7e University Policy Committee
- 2005-20/7f Awards Committee
- 2005-20/7g Council Administration Committee
- 2005-20/7g (i) **PAYNE/SHAMANNA MOVED THAT** Bill #19 be read a first time.
- Bill #19 - *Chairs of Standing Committees* (sponsor; LEWIS)**  
Principles (first reading)
1. Chairs of Standing Committees shall be paid.
- KIRKHAM/PAYNE MOVED TO** postpone Bill #19 to the February 7, 2006 meeting of Students' Council.
- Motion to Postpone: CARRIED**
- 2005-20/7g (ii) **KIRKHAM/PAYNE MOVED THAT** Bill #25 be read a first time.
- Bill #25 - *Speaker of Students' Council Reform* (sponsor: KIRKHAM)**  
Principles (first reading)
1. The Speaker of Students' Council will be elected from and by the voting members of Students' Council.
  2. The Speaker of Students' Council will be a voting member of Students' Council.
- Speaker's List (mm): Kirkham, Hussein
- Main Motion: DEFEATED**
- 2005-20/7j Student Affairs Committee
- 2005-20/7j (i) **KHANNA/GORDON MOVED THAT** Students' Council rescind the Political Policy "Discriminatory Business Practices"
- Speaker's List (mm): Khanna, Kawanami, Berghoff
- Point of Order: Berghoff – "I'm pretty sure this is not pertinent to the discussions on principle"
- Speaker: Point of Order not well taken.
- Speaker's List (mm): Payne, Power, Hussein Schneider, Kawanami, Crossman
- Point of Order: Shamanna – "I'm just wondering if this is a regurgitation of what we're already heard, or if this is new information that actually has to do with the main motion?"
- Speaker: Point of order not well taken.
- Speaker's List (mm): Crossman (cont'd)



**ICKERT/KIRKHAM MOVED THE** previous question.

**Motion to move the previous question: CARRIED**

**Main Motion: CARRIED**

2005-20/7j (ii)

**KHANNA/GORDON MOVED THAT** Students' Council adopt the proposed changes to the Political Policy "Faculty Weeks"

Speaker's List (mm): Gordon, Berghoff

**JOHNSON/BERGHOFF MOVED TO** refer the main motion back to the Student Affairs Committee.

**Motion to Refer: CARRIED**

2005-20/9

**GENERAL ORDERS**

2005-20/9a

**KIRKHAM/KELLY MOVED THAT** Students' Council rescind the "Tobacco Ban" political policy.

Speaker's List (mm): Kirkham, Aperocho, Kirkham, Lettner

Point of Order: Kirkham – "This doesn't have anything to do with rescinding the Tobacco Ban political policy. I'm not moving to create a new policy"

Speaker: "I'm not going to rule on that one"

Speaker's List (mm): Gordon

Point of Order: Kirkham – "Those comments were not in favour and the chair has several times in the past ruled out of order when neutrality comments were made to continue on the pattern that has been established".

Speaker: Point of Order well taken. Robert's Rules of Order states that there must be a transfer of comments made back and forth between those in favour and those opposed on the motion.

**CHAPMAN APPEALS THE** decision of the chair.

**Shall the decision of the chair stand as the judgement of the assembly?**  
**DEFEATED** (the floor is assigned to the Vice President Academic)

Speaker's List (mm): Johnson

Point of Order: Kirkham – "The comments, again, there is no motion here to get a new political policy".

Speaker: Point of Order not well taken.

**Main Motion: DEFEATED**

2005-20/9b

**JOHNSON/TOBIAS MOVED THAT** Students' Council approve the Political Policy "General Election Forum".

Speaker's List (mm): Johnson

**CROSSMAN/MORROW MOVED TO** amend the main motion by striking the last "Be it Resolved" statement.

Speaker's List (am): Crossman

**KIRKHAM MOVED TO** amend the amendment by striking the last "Whereas" statement as well.

**Amendment to the Amendment: FRIENDLY**

Speaker's List (am): Johnson, Tobias (sponsors Henderson)

**KAWANAMI MOVED TO** amend the amendment by adding "WHEREAS you cannot stop professors from being dicks"

**Amendment to the Amendment: OUT OF ORDER**

**Amendment to the Main Motion: DEFEATED**

**KIRKHAM/JOHNSON MOVED TO** refer the main motion to the University Policy Committee.

Speaker's List (ref): Kirkham, Khanna, Power

**Motion to Refer: CARRIED**

2005-20/9c

**LE ORDERED THAT THE** Vice-President Student Life Investigate the possibility of the Students' Union adding microwaves to CAB's lower level food court, and report back to council with a recommendation on how to proceed, no later than January 10, 2006.

**Motion dies for want of seconder.**

2005-20/9e

**JOHNSON/KELLY MOVED THAT** as per Bylaw 8451 section 6c, council approve the Engineering Students' Society's proposal outlining a faculty association membership fee

**Main Motion: CARRIED**

2005-20/9f

**SHAMANNA/TRAYNER MOVED THAT** as per Bylaw 8451 section 6c, council approve the University of Alberta Science Undergraduate Society's proposal outlining a faculty association membership fee

**Councillor/Councillor MOVED TO** postpone the main motion.

**Motion to Postpone: CARRIED**

**Councillor/Councillor MOVED TO** adjourn.

**Motion to Adjourn: CARRIED**

The meeting is adjourned at 9:59 p.m.

**ATTENDANCE (SC 2005-20)**

Faculty/Position	Name	1 <sup>st</sup> Roll Call	2 <sup>nd</sup> Roll Call
President	Graham Lettner	√	√
VP Academic	Mathieu Johnson	√	√
VP External	Samantha Power	√	√
VP Finance	Jason Tobias	√	√
VP Student Life	Justin Kehoe		
BoG Undergrad Rep.	Adam Cook	√	
Agriculture, Forestry and Home Economics	Miranda Baniulis		
Agriculture, Forestry and Home Economics	Amanda Rajotte	√	
Arts	Catrin Berghoff		
Arts	John Chandler		
Arts	Michelle Kelly	√	
Arts	Bryce Kustra		
Arts	Cameron Lewis		
Arts	Tim Schneider	√	√
Arts	Shad Thevenaz		
Arts	Al-Amyr Sumar	√	
Augustana	Jonathan Friesen		
Business	Chris Young		
Business	Ryan Payne		
Education	Lillian Patz		
Engineering	Brian Ceelen	√	√
Engineering	James Crossman	√	
Engineering	Prem Eruvs	√	
Engineering	Jamaal Montasser		
Law	Kyle Kawanami	√	
Medicine and Oral Health Sciences	Suneil Khanna	√	
Native Studies	Matt Wildcat		
Nursing	Nadia Ickert	√	
Faculté Saint-Jean	Joseph Blais		

Open Studies	Sabine Stephan		
Physical Education and Recreation	Philip Goebel		
Science	Sheena Aperocho	√	√
Science	Jack Gordon	√	√
Science	Abbeir Hussein	√	√
Science	Stephen Kirkham	√	√
Science	Sylvia Shamanna	√	
Science	Omer Yusuf		
Science	Yuan Hao		
Science	Chris Le	√	√
Science	Theresa Chapman	√	√
General Manager	Bill Smith		
Speaker	Gregory Harlow	√	√

### Guests of Council:

Position	Name
Chief Returning Officer	Rachel Woynorowski
The Gateway	Ross Prusakowski
The Gateway	Steve Smith
The Gateway	Daniel Kaszor
Director, Student Ombudservice	Chris Henderson

# STUDENTS' COUNCIL VOTES & PROCEEDINGS

---

Tuesday February 7, 2006  
Council Chambers 2-1 University Hall

## VOTES & PROCEEDINGS (SC 2005-21)

2005-21/1

### CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order at 6:03 p.m.

2005-21/2

### SPEAKER'S BUSINESS

2005-21/2a

Announcements - The next meeting of Students' Council will take place on February 28, 2006

2005-21/3

### APPROVAL OF THE ORDERS OF THE DAY

**KIRKHAM/PATZ MOVED TO** approve the orders of the day.

**KIRKHAM/SHAMANNA MOVED TO** amend the main motion by making items 4a, 4b, 9e, and 9f Special Orders.

Speaker's List (am): Kirkham

**Amendment to the Main Motion: CARRIED**

**KELLY/CHAPMAN MOVED TO** amend the main motion by adding item 9g (from the late additions) to the Order Paper.

Speaker's List (am): Kelly

**Amendment to the Main Motion: OUT OF ORDER**

**JOHNSON/KIRKHAM MOVED TO** amend the main motion by striking item 9a from the Order Paper.

Speaker's list (am): Johnson, Chapman, Kirkham

**Amendment to the Main Motion: CARRIED**

**SHAMANNA/LE MOVED TO** amend the main motion by making item 9d a Special Order.

Speaker's List (am): Shamanna

**Amendment to the Main Motion: CARRIED**

**SHAMANNA/APEROCHO MOVED TO** amend items 9e and 9f by striking the words "proposed plebiscite question:" and replace with the word "following:".

Speaker's List (am): Shamanna, Kirkham

**Amendment to the Main Motion: DEFEATED**

**Main Motion: CARRIED**

*Special Order 4b*

2005-21/4b

Jason Tobias, VPOF presents on the Power Plant.

*Special Order 4a*

2005-21/4a

Samantha Power, VPX and Graham Lettner, President presents on Tuition.

*Special Order 9d*

Point of Order: Kirkham – "I didn't make items 9d a Special Order someone did afterwards".

Speaker: Point of Order well taken.

*Special Order 9e*

2005-21/9e

**SHAMANNA/LETTNER MOVED THAT** Students' Council approve the proposed plebiscite question:

Do you support the establishment of a non-instructional fee, levied by the University of Alberta, subject to:

1. Increase the University Health Centre fee by 24% per term (\$6.00) in 2006-2007, with a further gradual increase of 6.3% (\$2.00) in 2007-2008 and 6.3% (\$2.00) in 2008-2009.

**SHAMANNA/BLAIS MOVED TO** amend the main motion by striking the words "proposed plebiscite question:" and replace with the word "following:"

Speaker's List (am): Shamanna, Kirkham

**Amendment to the Main Motion: DEFEATED**

Speaker's List (mm): Shamanna, Kirkham, Baniulis

Point of Order: Shamanna – "I don't see how this is actually a question, it's more like an argument opposed to the main motion".

Speaker: Point of Order sustained

Speaker's List (mm): Tobias

**SCHNEIDER MOVED THE** previous question.

**Motion to move the Previous Question: OUT OF ORDER**

Speaker's List (mm): Shamanna, Kustra

**BLAIS MOVED THE** Previous Question

**Motion to move the Previous Question: OUT OF ORDER**

Speaker's List (mm): Gordon, Power

Point of Order: Shamanna – "I believe that the part of the fee increase that actually has to do with ceasing to see staff and only to see students exclusively was item 9f and item 9e doesn't actually deal with ceasing to see staff".

Speaker: Point of order not well taken. The whole thing deals with UHS either way.

**Main Motion: DEFEATED**

**KIRKHAM MOVED THAT** item 9f be struck from the order paper

**Motion to Strike: FRIENDLY**

**SCHNEIDER/COUNCILLOR MOVED TO** suspend Standing Order #46.

Speaker's List (susp): Schneider

**Motion to Suspend: CARRIED**

*Special Order 9d*

2005-21/9d

**SHAMANNA/LE MOVED THAT** as per Bylaw 8451 section 6c, Council approve the University of Alberta Science Undergraduate Society's proposal outlining a faculty association membership fee

Speaker's List (mm): Shamanna, Schneider, Johnson, Kawanami, Shamanna, Gordon, Morrow, Crossman, Kelly

Point of Order: Lewis – "Mr. Speaker, I'm not sure if this is germane to the Faculty Association Membership Fee's"

Speaker: Point of Order not well taken.

**LEWIS/BLAIS MOVED THE** Previous question

**Motion to move the Previous Question: DEFEATED**

Speaker's List (mm): Le, Kirkham

Point of Order: Shamanna – "I'm wondering if we're discussing the Bylaws in front of us today, as well as last weeks Bylaws and anything else that was given to us last week or given to us today".

Speaker: Point of order not well taken

**KIRKHAM/KELLY MOVED TO** read from papers

**Motion to Read from Papers: CARRIED**

Speaker's List (mm): Kirkham cont'd

**HUSSEIN/LEWIS MOVED THE** Previous Question

**Motion to move the Previous Question: CARRIED**

**Main Motion: DEFEATED**

2005-21/6

**REPORTS AND EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE REPORT**

2005-21/6a

Mathieu Johnson, Vice President (Academic)

2005-21/6b

Graham Lettner, President

2005-21/6d

Justin Kehoe, Vice President (Student Life)

2005-21/6e

Adam Cook, Undergraduate Board of Governors Representative

2005-21/6f

Jason Tobias, Vice President (Operations and Finance)

2005-21/6g

Samantha Power, Vice President (External)

2005-21/6c

Executive Committee Report

2005-21/6c (i)

**TOBIAS/KEHOE MOVED THAT** Students' Council approve a transfer of \$3000.00 from the Special Projects Reserve to the election budget to cover the increased costs of upgrading the electoral system.

Speaker's List (mm): Tobias (sponsors CRO)

**Main Motion: CARRIED**

2005-21/7

**QUESTION PERIOD**

Point of Order: Blais – "Do we have quorum?"

Speaker: Point of order not well taken. We do not need quorum for question period.

2005-21/8

**BOARD AND COMMITTEE REPORTS**

2005-21/8a

Council Administration Committee

2005-21/8a (i)

**LEWIS/CROSSMAN MOVED THAT** Bill #19 be read a first time.

**Bill #19 - *Chairs of Standing Committees* (sponsor; LEWIS)**  
Principles (first reading)

1. Chairs of Standing Committees shall be paid.

Speaker's List (mm): Lewis



Point of Order: Berghoff – “Quorum”

Speaker: Point of order well taken, I will take roll call. Quorum obtained.

**KUSTRA/LEWIS MOVED TO** amend the main motion by adding principle 2  
“Effective May 1, 2006”

**Amendment to the Main Motion: FRIENDLY**

Speaker’s List (mm): Kirkham

**CHAPMAN/BLAIS MOVED TO** refer Bill #19 to the Budget and Finance Committee.

Speaker’s List (ref): Chapman, Schneider

**Motion to Refer: CARRIED, 9/7**

2005-21/8b Budget and Finance Committee

2005-21/8c **TOBIAS/LEWIS MOVED THAT** Bill #29 be read a first time.

**Bill #29 – ELB Retirement (sponsor; TOBIAS)**

Principles (first reading)

1. Cease collection of the Eugene L. Brody dedicated fee.
2. The amount remaining in the Eugene L. Brody reserve fund shall be transferred into the Student Involvement Endowment Fund for the purpose of funding scholarships for undergraduate students.

Speaker’s List (mm): Tobias, Kelly, Lewis, Kirkham (sponsors Ms. Barer), Tobias, Cook, Chapman, Kawanami

**Main Motion: DEFEATED**

2005-21/8c Audit Committee

2005-21/9 **GENERAL ORDERS**

2005-21/9b **CHAPMAN/CROSSMAN MOVED THAT** Students’ Council order the Council Administration Committee to investigate ways that Augustana councillors can more easily be involved on council and that they report back to council with recommendations by the 21st of February 2006.

Speaker’s List (mm): Chapman

**KIRKHAM MOVED TO** amend the main motion by striking the words “21<sup>st</sup> of February 2006” and replace with “March 14, 2006”.

**Amendment to the Main Motion: FRIENDLY**

**Main Motion: CARRIED, unanimous consent**

2005-21/9c

**POWER/BERGHOFF MOVED THAT** Bill #28 be read a first time.

**Bill #28 Effective Political Policy Reform (sponsor; POWER)**  
Principles (first reading)

1. The existing legislative provisions regarding political policy are repealed.
2. Political policies are directives from students' council to the exec committee outlining where students' unions advocacy efforts should be directed.
3. For each political policy passed the exec committee is required to develop an implementation plan, which will outline the actions to be taken and resources required in a given year.
4. Are adopted, amended or rescinded by two simple majority votes of students' council occurring not less than 7 days apart.

Speaker's List (mm): Power, Kawanami

**JOHNSON/CHAPMAN MOVED TO** adjourn.

**Motion to Adjourn: CARRIED**

The meeting was adjourned at 10:00 p.m.

**ATTENDANCE (SC 2005-21)**

Faculty/Position	Name	1 <sup>st</sup> Roll Call	2 <sup>nd</sup> Roll Call
President	Graham Lettner	✓	
VP Academic	Mathieu Johnson	✓	✓
VP External	Samantha Power	✓	✓
VP Finance	Jason Tobias	✓	✓
VP Student Life	Justin Kehoe	✓	✓
BoG Undergrad Rep.	Adam Cook	✓	✓
Agriculture, Forestry and Home Economics	Miranda Baniulis	✓	✓
Agriculture, Forestry and Home Economics	Amanda Rajotte		
Arts	Catrin Berghoff	✓	✓
Arts	John Chandler	✓	✓
Arts	Michelle Kelly	✓	✓
Arts	Bryce Kustra	✓	✓
Arts	Cameron Lewis	✓	✓
Arts	Tim Schneider	✓	✓
Arts	Shad Thevenaz	✓	

Arts	Al-Amyn Sumar	√	
Augustana	Jonathan Friesen		
Business	Chris Young		
Business	Ryan Payne		
Education	Lillian Patz	√	√
Engineering	Brian Ceelen	√	
Engineering	James Crossman	√	√
Engineering	Prem Eruvs	√	
Engineering	Jamaal Montasser		
Law	Kyle Kawanami	√	√
Medicine and Oral Health Sciences	Suneil Khanna	√	
Native Studies	Matt Wildcat		
Nursing	Nadia Ickert		
Faculté Saint-Jean	Joseph Blais	√	√
Open Studies	Sabine Stephan		
Physical Education and Recreation	Philip Goebel		
Science	Sheena Aperocho	√	√
Science	Jack Gordon	√	√
Science	Abbeir Hussein		
Science	Stephen Kirkham	√	√
Science	Sylvia Shamanna	√	√
Science	Omer Yusuf	√	√
Science	Yuan Hao		
Science	Chris Le	√	√
Science	Theresa Chapman	√	√
General Manager	Bill Smith		
Speaker	Gregory Harlow	√	√

**Guests of Council:**

Position	Name
----------	------

The Chief Returning Officer	Rachel Woynorowski
The Gateway	Ross Prusakowski
Undergrad Art Student	M. Mustafa Hirji
Ag/For/Home Ec Student	Chris Jones
DIE Board Tribune	Dane Bullerwell
Undergrad Science Student	Vanessa Thomas

February 15, 2006

University of Alberta Students' Council,

I would like to respond to the letter that the University Health Centre sent on February 10, 2006 concerning my comments. In some cases I have used incorrect information and I apologize for this. However, I believe that the broad strokes of my argument remain.

### **1. Others Benefit from Student Subsidization of the University Health Centre**

I was incorrect to claim that graduate students do not pay the health services fee. I was repeating the claim that the Students' Union has made previously and I should have double-checked this. I apologize for the error.

However, the health services fee is not paid by staff at the University. We all agree on this. But while staff do have to pay full third party billing fees, they do not pay the full cost of prescription drugs. This is evidenced by section 2(d) of the University Health Centre's submission to Students' Council. As well, Dr. McInroy's comments at the January 24, 2006 meeting of Students' Council were as follows:

“We were told outright [by the Colleges of Pharmacists]: any subsidy that goes to the students has to go to all the insurance companies. The Academic Plan, the Non-Academic Plan, teachers' plan, whatever plans we use, the same prices we use goes to those companies.”

(From <http://dl.su.ualberta.ca/2005-2006/SC19-02%20PResentation%204B.MP3>)

It cannot be denied that staff are benefiting from student subsidization of the University Health Centre through the subsidization of prescription drug costs. (I accept that this may not be your choice.)

(Also, Dr. McInroy stated at the meeting that 13–18% of physician time, not 10% of their time, is spent on seeing staff patients. But this is not central to my argument.)

### **2. Subsidizing Costs of Insured Services**

The University Health Centre claims that they are not paying for insured services, but rather for the peer education program, the dietician, and to subsidize the support staffing during the summer.

However, in the University Health Centre's submission to Students' Council, they wrote that if the fee increase was not granted,

“Positions would have to be cut back within UHC ... This would be followed by cutting back on family physician support which would result in the loss of 2-3 family physician positions.”

When a physician offers an insured medical service, the physician bills Alberta Health Care for the costs. This cost is supposed to include the physician's services and the support costs for providing it. As the *Alberta Health Care Insurance Act* notes

9(1) No physician or dentist who is opted into the Plan who provides insured services to a person shall charge or collect from any person an amount in addition to the benefits payable by the Minister for those insured services.

11(1) No person shall charge or collect from any person

(a) an amount for any goods or services that are provided as a condition to receiving an insured service provided by a physician or dentist who is opted into the Plan, or

(b) an amount the payment of which is a condition to receiving an insured service

provided by a physician or dentist who is opted into the Plan where the amount is in addition to the benefits payable by the Minister for the insured service.

(2) Subsection (1) does not prohibit the charging or collecting of an amount paid for non-insured health or pharmaceutical goods or services where the charging or collecting of that amount is not otherwise prohibited under this Act or the Hospitals Act and a physician or dentist reasonably determines that it is necessary to provide the non-insured health or pharmaceutical goods or services before the insured service is provided.

As these sections make clear, when being offered an insured service, a physician cannot “charge or collect ... an amount in addition” to what Alberta Health Care pays for that service. And support staff and infrastructure cannot reasonably mean “health or pharmaceutical goods or services” described in the exemption in section 11(2).

The response on February 10, 2006 does not make explain how 2–3 family physician positions can be at risk. They should not be since these physicians and the cost of materials and support for them should be covered by the billings to Alberta Health Care. The only way this is true is if the physicians spend most of their time offering uninsured services.

### **3. The Rate of Rising Costs**

The University Health Centre argues for a 24% increase in fee as opposed to something closer to inflation because they have three cost drivers: first, a 3.5% increase in support staff costs; second, a 70% increase in utility costs since 1998; and third, rising salaries for physicians and nurses.

The third of these reasons should be rejected on its face: physician salaries and of any nurses supporting those physicians should be covered by Alberta Health Care billings. These should not be subsidized by students.

As for the increase in utility costs, the 70% increase since 1998 comes out to about a 10% increase annually. Assuming this continues and there is a 3.5% increase in support staff salaries, that cannot possibly require a single year 24% increase—both numbers are below 24% and account for only a fraction of the costs that should be subsidized. However, if we look at the University of Alberta’s projected utility costs in the proposed 2006–2007 budget, we see that utility costs are expected to decrease slightly in the next few years. So the 10% per year increase in utility costs is not consistent with expectations of utility costs. If they mean for the 24% to cover past operating cost increases, the question must be asked how the University Health Centre currently operates. The 24% single year increase does not seem to be justified.

However, more importantly, not all utility costs and support staff costs should be subsidized. Any support staff or utilities being used to support physicians offering insured medical services should not be subsidized by students: these should be the overhead costs that are covered by billings to Alberta Health Care.

I have not seen a justification for why the University Health Centre needs a single year 24% increase in the health services fee. Many of their cost increases do not seem to be costs that should be subsidized by students but rather as costs that should be covered by billings to Alberta Health Care.

If you think about it, when you visit a private health clinic to receive an insured service, you do not pay any user fee. These health clinics surely experience the same increases in support staff costs, utility costs, and physician and nursing salaries that the University Health Centre experiences. Yet they aren’t instituting new user fees. Neither should the University Health Centre.

Subsidizing pharmaceuticals, nutrition consults, and third party (uninsured) medicals is allowable, of course. And if this were the reason for the increase, that would be fair. However, the University Health Centre has pointed to the rising cost of everything but pharmaceuticals and the dietician on staff. While some support staffing and nurses likely support these non-insured services, I understand that this is not the majority of their staff complement.

#### **4. The Temporary Health Services Fee Increase**

The University Health Centre points out that the health services fee has been decreased to eliminate the temporary increase. Since on March 18, 2005 the University budget was approved with a schedule of fees that did not include the reduction of the fee, and since the non-instructional fees schedule that was circulated last February did not include a reduction of the fee, I had assumed that the reduction did not occur. I assume the reduction was a later amendment to the fees schedule.

In any case, I apologize for my error. It was my fault not to do more careful research.

#### **5. The Proposed Fee Increase as a Replacement for the Aforementioned Fee's Decrease**

The University Health Centre admits that the proposed health services fee increase is, in part, a replacement for lost operating capital from the elimination of the temporary health services fee increase. So neither of us deny this. It is, in part, a fee replacement. And if we both agree that overcharging of this fee occurred, then it was paying for costs that otherwise would not have existed (save some other fee increase having occurred).

I characterized the fee replacement as “sneaky” because on January 24, 2006 Dr. McInroy refused to either acknowledge that the temporary fee increase was temporary, nor that it was for paying back a mortgage on renovations done to their space in SUB. To quote:

**Councillor Kirkham:** My understanding is that in 1997 in which the speaker said that was the last time the fee was raised, that was actually for ... to pay for a mortgage ...

**Dr. McInroy:** No.

**Councillor Kirkham:** ... for renovations ...

**Dr. McInroy:** No. This was a specific fee that I presented to the committee because we were in the same situation as we are now, looking at crashing and burning. Literally. And it was also a very difficult time, we were working our way through all the cuts that had gone on at the time. That was totally separate. Ironically enough, it was about the same time that the mortgage went, but also the health fee. And actually, the health fee might have been ... could have been ... 1996, could have been the year before. It was in there anyway. But I specifically requested nothing to do with the mortgage which was a completely separate entity.

(From <http://dl.su.ualberta.ca/2005-2006/SC19-02%20Presentation%204B.MP3>)

This is the “lie” that I was accusing them of. As I showed in my letter on February 7, 2006, both of these above assertions were incorrect. (Perhaps Dr. McInroy was confused by the \$5.00/term increase effective September 1998?)

I don't accuse anyone of lying lightly. But it seems clear that in this case lies were put forward to Students' Council. Hence, it seemed “sneaky” to me.

#### **6. Financial Information Provided**

Finally, to comment on financial information provided, I am unaware of any University Health Centre financial statements on the internet other than those included in the University of Alberta financial statements. These do not provide much detail, and certainly nothing to show me the need

for the health services fee increase.

More detailed information was provided to Jason Tobias, however, this information was not sufficiently detailed. For example, it is not at all clear which expenses relate to provision of insured services and which relate to elective services. This information is key in order to fully appreciate the stated need for the Health Services Fee increase.

### **Concluding Comments**

I was clearly at fault in a couple of instances with incorrect data. I apologize for this. However, from my end I have seen several untrue statements made by the University Health Centre, and I have seen statements that indicate that the University Health Centre plans to use a health services fee increase to subsidize insured medical services. I find both of these unacceptable and that is why they were emphasized in my letter to Students' Council on February 7, 2006. They were however not my only concerns.

It is unfortunate that this issue has taken the route that it has. There is clearly substantial misinformation and confusion surrounding this issue and the extraordinarily short timeline has not allowed the truth of the fee choice at hand to be clearly presented to Students' Council. The accusatory language around this (of which I am admittedly at fault) has not helped resolve these. Hopefully this confusion can be resolved and the choice before students clarified.

Until then, however, I continue to have serious concerns about the proposed health services fee as outlined above and in my letter of February 7, 2006.

Sincerely,

M. Mustafa Hirji

cc: Dr. Gordon McInroy, Director University Health Centre  
Kevin Friese, Administrator University Health Centre  
Dr. Bill Connor, Vice-Provost & Dean of Students